



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 20

FIRST SESSION, THIRTY-SEVENTH LEGISLATURE

PRAYERS

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

Hon. Mr. DOER, the Honourable First Minister made a statement regarding the Manitoba Century Summit,

Mr. FILMON and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

Hon. Mr. ASHTON, the Minister of Highways and Government Services made a statement regarding the Commons Agriculture Committee meeting held yesterday in Ottawa,

Mr. MAGUIRE and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH presented:

Annual Report of The Discriminatory Business Practices Act for the fiscal year ending March 31, 1999.

(Sessional Paper No. 123)

Annual Report of the Chief Judge of the Provincial Court of Manitoba Concerning Complaints about Judicial Conduct for the year ending December 31, 1999.

(Sessional Paper No. 124)

Annual Review of the Office of the Chief Medical Examiner for the year 1998.

(Sessional Paper No. 125)

The following Bills were, by leave, severally introduced, had the purposes outlined thereof and were read a First Time:

(No. 22) – The Court of Queen's Bench Surrogate Practice Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur la pratique relative aux successions devant la Cour du Banc de la Reine

(Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH)

(No. 23) – The Jury Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les jurés

(Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH)

(No. 24) – The Personal Property Security Amendment and Various Acts Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les sûretés relatives aux biens personnels et d'autres dispositions législatives
(Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX)

Following Oral Questions, Mr. Speaker made the following ruling:

During Oral Questions on April 26, 2000, I took under advisement a point of order raised by the Honourable Official Opposition House Leader regarding words spoken by the Honourable Minister of Education while replying to a question. The Official Opposition House Leader indicated that he heard the words “deliberately misleading” used, and requested that the words be withdrawn. The Honourable Government House Leader also spoke to the point of order, and indicated that the Honourable Minister of Education was paraphrasing or citing comments from the Selkirk Journal. I took the matter under advisement in order to peruse Hansard.

I thank the Honourable House Leaders for their contributions to the point of order.

I have reviewed Hansard, and on page 608, the Honourable Minister of Education is quoted as saying “The Selkirk Journal has indicated that the province may deserve an apology for what they characterize as deliberately misleading statements.”

Previous Manitoba Speakers have ruled that language is parliamentary if it is not directed towards specific Members. Mr. Speaker Rocan ruled on June 4, 1991 that as the words in question were not addressed to specific Members, they were therefore not unparliamentary. Similar rulings were made by Madam Speaker Dacquay on April 3, 1996, April 12, 1996, October 28, 1996, April 30, 1999 and May 4, 1999.

In reviewing the entire paragraph containing the remarks complained of, the Minister of Education does not make explicit reference to a particular Member. As the words in question were not directed explicitly towards a particular Member, it is difficult for the Speaker to rule that there is a point of order.

However, I wish to address one of the points made during the raising of the point of order, namely that the Minister was not using unparliamentary language because he was quoting from another source. I must advise the House that previous Manitoba Speakers have ruled that it is out of order to use unparliamentary language, even when the words in question are originating from another source.

On April 7, 1999, Madam Speaker Dacquay ruled that it was out of order to call another Member a liar while attributing the words spoken to a constituent. Similarly, Speaker Rocan ruled on October 5, 1989, that quoting the words of another person which were unparliamentary is out of order. In a statement on June 30, 1978, Speaker Graham quoted from the parliamentary authority, Erskine May, which reads “A Member is not allowed to use unparliamentary words by the device of putting them in someone else’s mouth.” This quotation is also contained in the current edition of Erskine May.

I would therefore request that the Honourable Minister select his words carefully, especially when quoting from another source.

Pursuant to Rule 23(1), Mrs. SMITH (Fort Garry), Messrs. MARTINDALE and ROCAN, Ms. CERILLI and Hon. Mr. GERRARD made Members' Statements.

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK:

WHEREAS excess rainfall in the fall of 1998 and spring of 1999 resulted in over one million acres of land going unseeded, primarily in the southwest, but also in other areas of the province; and

WHEREAS the federal government has recognized the disaster situation and is compensating people for mould and other property damage under the Disaster Financial Assistance Arrangements (DFAA); and

WHEREAS farmers lost chemical and fertilizer inputs and incurred extra costs to restore their land and for weed control, at the same time as they had no 1999 crop to sell; and

WHEREAS the Manitoba Government has repeatedly requested support from the federal government, which has the lead responsibility for disaster financing, for farmers who sustained damage to their land; and

WHEREAS the Manitoba Government pursued support for compensation under Section 25 of the DFAA, which specifies loss of applied fertilizer and land restoration and was turned down by the federal government; and

WHEREAS the Manitoba Government requested a Canada/Manitoba agreement for the provision of assistance similar to the levels provided in the 1996 Saguenay River Flood, the 1997 Red River Valley Flood and the 1998 Eastern Canada Ice storm, and the federal government has refused; and

WHEREAS there has been all-party cooperation on lobbying the federal government for assistance for Manitoba farmers.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba urge the federal government to reconsider its position on funding for the 1999 flooding which occurred throughout the province, but specifically in the southwest, and include loss of applied fertilizer and land restoration as eligible costs under the DFAA; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba urge the federal government to consider programs and assistance similar to that provided for disasters such as the 1996 Saguenay River Flood, the 1997 Red River Valley Flood and the 1998 Eastern Canada ice storm.

And on the Proposed Amendment of Mr. PENNER (Emerson):

THAT the motion be amended by adding the following after the first "BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED" clause:

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the current Government of Manitoba acknowledge that, to date, the assistance it has provided to farmers affected by the 1999 flood has been insufficient, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that if the Manitoba Government is unable to secure support for 1999 Manitoba flood victims under the DFAA, that the Manitoba Government consider negotiating a 50-50 cost-shared program with the Federal Government; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that should the Manitoba Government fail to come to agreement with the Federal Government on a cost-shared disaster assistance program, that the Manitoba Government ensure all Manitobans that the monies required to alleviate the disaster will be included in the 2000/2001 Budget.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Mr. MAGUIRE concluding his remarks,

And Messrs. SMITH (Brandon West), TWEED, NEVAKSHONOFF and DERKACH having spoken,

And Mr. STRUTHERS speaking at 5:00 p.m.

The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

Mr. LOEWEN moved:

Resolution No. 5: REDI Program Success

WHEREAS the well-being of economic life in rural Manitoba can be directly attributed to creative and healthy local business; and

WHEREAS the Progressive Conservative Government initiated programs like Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) and Grow Bonds in order to contribute to the strength and diversity of Manitoba's rural economy and help rural communities and entrepreneurs seize opportunities for continued economic growth; and

WHEREAS REDI has helped to fund more than 300 rural communities and entrepreneurs generate a total leveraged investment of approximately \$106 million while creating or maintaining 2,700 full-time jobs; and

Wednesday, May 3, 2000

WHEREAS Manitoba Grow Bonds have leveraged more than \$28 million in capital investment in rural Manitoba, enabling the start-up or expansion of rural business, creating employment opportunities for approximately 700 people.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba urge the Government of Manitoba to consider continuing the programs initiated by the previous government that ensure the continued economic growth and diversification of rural Manitoba.

And a debate arising,

And Mr. LOEWEN speaking,

During the debate, Hon. Mr. ASHTON rose on a point order regarding comments made by the Honourable Member for Fort Whyte with regards to the absence of an Honourable Member,

And Mr. LOEWEN voluntarily withdrew his remarks,

And Mr. LOEWEN concluding his remarks,

And Messrs. DEWAR, DYCK, STRUTHERS and FAURSCHOU having spoken,

And Mr. SMITH (Brandon West) speaking at 6:00 p.m.

The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. Thursday, May 4, 2000.

Hon. George HICKES,
Speaker.