



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 28**

**SECOND SESSION, THIRTY-EIGHTH LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYERS**

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

The following petitions were presented:

Mr. LAMOUREUX – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to consider recognizing the need to sit for a minimum of 80 days in any given calendar year. (J. Budde, T. Melnyk, S. Budde and others)

Mr. GOERTZEN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider ending his government's forced unionization plan of companies involved with the Red River Floodway expansion and to consider entering into discussions with business, construction and labour groups to ensure any qualified company and worker, regardless of their union status, is afforded the opportunity to bid and work on the floodway expansion project. (D. Neufeld, D. Hiebert, E. Ninaber and others)

Mr. EICHLER – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Minister of Transportation and Government Services to consider having Highway 227 paved from the junction of Highway 248 and 227 all the way to Highway 16 the Yellow Head route and to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider supporting said initiatives to ensure for the safety of our Manitobans and all Canadians who travel along Manitoba Highways. (M. St. Goddard, L. St. Goddard, T. Turner and others)

Mr. HAWRANIK – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider ending his government's forced unionization plan of companies involved with the Red River Floodway expansion and to consider entering into discussions with business, construction and labour groups to ensure any qualified company and worker, regardless of their union status, is afforded the opportunity to bid and work on the floodway expansion project. (G. Friesen, P. Funk, R. Funk and others)

Mr. MURRAY – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider ending his government's forced unionization plan of companies involved with the Red River Floodway expansion and to consider entering into discussions with business, construction and labour groups to ensure any qualified company and worker, regardless of their union status, is afforded the opportunity to bid and work on the floodway expansion project. (L. Grey, L. Davidson, D. Grey and others)

During Oral Questions, Mr. DERKACH rose on a point of order regarding the comments spoken by the Honourable Minister of Finance and requested that he tabled the document that he was quoting from and withdraw his remarks.

And Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH and Mr. TWEED having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.

From his decision, Mr. DERKACH appealed to the House,

And the Question being put. "Shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained?"

It was agreed to, on the following division:

**YEA**

ALLAN	MALOWAY
ALTEMEYER	MARTINDALE
ASHTON	MCGIFFORD
BJORNSON	MELNICK
BRICK	MIHYCHUK
CALDWELL	OSWALD
CHOMIAK	REID
DEWAR	ROBINSON
IRVIN-ROSS	RONDEAU
JENNISSEN	SALE
JHA	SANTOS
KORZENIOWSKI	SHELLENBERG
LATHLIN	SELINGER
LEMIEUX	SMITH
MACKINTOSH	STRUTHERS ..... 30

**NAY**

CUMMINGS	MITCHELSON
DERKACH	MURRAY
DRIEDGER	PENNER
EICHLER	REIMER
FAURSCHOU	ROCAN
GERRARD	ROWAT
GOERTZEN	SCHULER
HAWRANIK	STEFANSON
LAMOUREUX	TAILLIEU
LOEWEN	TWEED ..... 21
MAGUIRE	

---

Subsequently during Oral Questions, Mr. TWEED rose on a Matter of Privilege and moved:

THAT the Minister of Finance did break the privileges of myself by quoting directly from a legal opinion indicating that illegal activities were occurring at the Manitoba Lotteries Corporation and that this House finds the Minister of Finance in contempt of this House for casting aspersions against employees of the Manitoba Lotteries Corporation; and furthermore that this Minister be directed to withdraw his comments and apologize or provide to this House the legal opinion, as referenced by the Minister; and

THAT this matter be referred to the Committee on Legislative Affairs for the Committee's consideration.

And Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH, Mr. DERKACH, Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. CUMMINGS having spoken.

WHEREUPON Mr. Speaker informed the House he would take the matter under advisement.

---

Subsequently during Oral Questions, Mr. CUMMINGS rose on a Matter of Privilege and moved:

THAT this serious matter be referred to the Committee on Legislative Affairs and be reported in this House.

And Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH, Messrs. DERKACH and ROCAN having spoken.

WHEREUPON Mr. Speaker informed the House he would take the matter under advisement.

---

Pursuant to Rule 26(1), Messrs. EICHLER, JHA and MAGUIRE, Ms. OSWALD and Mrs. ROWAT made Members' Statements.

---

Prior to Orders of the Day, Mr. LAMOUREUX rose on a Matter of Urgent Public Importance and moved:

THAT under Rule 36(1) the regular business of the House be set aside to deal with a Matter of Urgent Public Importance, being the need to consider new information which suggests that the budget which provides for an increase in the retail sales tax is not revenue neutral and would therefore require that there be a referendum before the vote on the budget is held.

And Mr. LAMOUREUX, Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH and Mr. DERKACH having spoken to the urgency of the motion,

WHEREUPON Mr. Speaker ruled as follows:

I thank Honourable Members for their advice to the Chair on whether the motion proposed by the Honourable Member for Inkster should be debated today. The notice required by Rule 36(1) was provided.

Rule 36 and Beuchesne citations 389 and 390 provide two tests for a Matter of Urgent Public Importance to meet in order for debate to proceed; first, is the subject matter so pressing that the ordinary opportunities for debate will not allow it to be brought out early enough, and second, has it been shown that the public interest will suffer if this matter is not given immediate attention.

Manitoba precedent from past rulings of Speakers shows that the scope of the Budget speech debate, which is underway today, is wide enough to encompass the discussion of most subjects, including the one raised by the Honourable Member. In addition, there may be other opportunities, such as Question Period and Members' Statements to raise the issue.

Respecting the second test for a Matter of Urgent Public Importance to proceed, that is, will the public interest suffer if the matter is not given immediate attention, although this undoubtedly is a serious issue that the Member has brought forward, I do not believe the public interest will be harmed if the business of the House is not set aside to debate the motion today.

Therefore, I must rule that this matter does not meet the criteria set by our Rules and precedents, and I rule the motion out of order as a Matter of Urgent Public Importance.

---

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. SELINGER:

THAT this House approves in general the budgetary policy of the government.

And on the Proposed Amendment of Mr. MURRAY,

*THAT the motion be amended by deleting all the words after "House" and substituting the following:*

therefore regrets this Budget ignores the present and future needs of Manitobans by:

- (a) failing to offer any vision or hope or to reflect the priorities of Manitobans;
- (b) failing to provide a long-term economic plan to grow the economy and create real and lasting jobs;
- (c) failing to provide a long-term tax reduction strategy that addresses the fact that middle-income Manitobans are now, under the Doer government, the highest taxed west of New Brunswick and our business taxes are not competitive;
- (d) failing to provide a sustainable provincial spending plan by introducing a budget with a spending/tax cut ratio of 7 to 1;
- (e) failing to commit to assume provincial constitutional responsibility to fund public education;

(f) failing to address the challenges in health care, including: providing a cardiac care system that meets the needs of Manitobans in a timely fashion, ending hallway medicine as promised, reducing waiting lists for diagnostic services including CT scans, MRIs, and ultrasounds; and recruiting and retaining health care professionals;

(g) failing to address the need to have bold, innovative and meaningful reform in health care that would reduce waiting lists and would increase access to quality care;

(h) failing to protect seniors and low-income Manitobans by increasing the Pharmacare deductible by 5% for the third year in a row, and introducing 2 new deductible levels; and

(i) failing to provide adequate supports to Manitoba's agricultural sector, especially those farm families struggling through the BSE crisis.

As a consequence, the Government has thereby lost the confidence of this House and the people of Manitoba.

And on the Proposed Amendment of Hon. Mr. GERRARD,

*THAT the amendment be amended by adding thereto the following words:*

And further regrets that this Budget also ignores present and future needs of Manitobans by:

(j) failing to set priorities well and to manage fiscal resources well;

(k) failing to reduce Ministers' salaries by 20% in recognition of the deficit incurred in the last fiscal year and the resultant increase in the general purpose debt of Manitoba;

(l) failing to support improvements in water stewardship and instead increasing administration and bureaucracy while failing to provide adequate support to surface and groundwater management and fisheries and water quality; and

(m) failing to provide adequate attention to healthy living by failing to provide adequate attention to sports funding in Manitoba.

And the debate continuing on the sub-amendment,

And Mr. MALOWAY, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Ms. KORZENIOWSKI and Mr. HAWRANIK having spoken,

And Hon. Mr. BJORNSON speaking at 5:30 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

---

**Tuesday, April 27, 2004**

---

Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH presented:

Sequence for consideration of the Estimates by the Committee of Supply, both in the Chamber and outside the Chamber.

(Sessional Paper No. 38)

---

The House then adjourned at 5:30 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Wednesday, April 28, 2004.

Hon. George HICKES,  
Speaker.